

**NATIONAL COMPETITIVE BIDDING
FOR**

**Selection of Agency for Third Party Verification of Result Based Financing result and
Project Evaluation under Mizoram Health Systems Strengthening Project (MHSSP)
(Two-Envelope Bidding Process without e-Procurement)**

**Minutes of Pre-Bid Meeting for Selection of Agency for Third Party Verification of
Result Based Financing result and Project Evaluation**

Date: 01.12.2020

With reference to the above, the proposals were invited for "Selection of Agency for Third Party Verification of Result Based Financing result and Project Evaluation of Mizoram Health Systems Strengthening Project (MHSSP)"

Ref No: IN-DOHFW-201459-CS-QCBS

The Pre-Bid meeting was virtually held on scheduled date i.e. 17. 11.2020 at (14.00 hrs) as per below link:

<https://us05web.zoom.us/j/3813680941?pwd=MXZzWDh1ME0yYmdiVmZmejlxM2kxdz09>

A) Officers present from MHSSP, Department of Health and Family Welfare:

- 1) Dr Lalnuntluangi, Addl. Project Director
- 2) Dr Vanlalchhuangi, Team Assistant

B) Bidder Representative present:

- 1) Mr Kapil Dev Singh, IQVIA
- 2) Mr Vinayak Sarolia, IQVIA
- 3) Mr Ravindra Kumar, KPMG
- 4) Mr Shefali Ahlawat, EY
- 5) Mr Pragnya Sonal, Sutra Consulting
- 6) Mr Swapnil Basakhatre, Sutra Consulting

List of queries raised and clarifications of the same is attached as **Annexure-1**, amendment is attached as **Amendment- I and** email submission of proposals as **Annexure-II**.

Enclosure: As mentioned above



Project Director,
MHSSP,
Department of Health and Family Welfare
Aizawl, Mizoram, **Pin** 796009

Annex 1

Queries raised by the bidders in Pre-Bid meeting for “Selection of Agency for Third Party Verification of Result Based Financing result and Project Evaluation under Mizoram Health System Strengthening Project (MHSSP)” held on November, 2020

Section No	Page No	Text	Query	Clarification
			Agency selected for the Assignment can take up other assignments	All agencies can apply for more than one assignment that includes the RFP for Selection of Agency for Third Party Verification of Result Based Financing result and Project Evaluation under Mizoram Health System Strengthening Project (MHSSP)". However, the consultancy firm who is awarded this M&E assignment cannot be assigned other consultancies for which the present assignment consultant monitors their work, due to conflict of interest .
Section 3.	70	Reference: 3.1 The consultant firm will be responsible for design, development and deployment of three surveys, baseline, midline and end line, which will include the sub-teams in the directorate, district health administration, all the health facilities including 10-DH, -SDH, 7-CHC and 56-PHC, 40 -Sub centre, 100 villages.	Do the agency needs to cover all the health facilities mentioned in the TOR during three rounds of survey or the agency can come up with the strategy to select representation of health facilities given in the RFP. Mode of data collection is already pre decided by the client or the agency can suggest the method either CAPI or PAPI?	The agency needs to cover all the facilities for Baseline, Midline and End line survey. The number of facilities will be all the DH, SDH, CHC and PHC. However, the sample can be selected under each cycle for the 40 sub centres and 100 villages from the two districts of Kolasib and Lawngtlai combined. The mode of data collection needs to be proposed by the agency in the proposal.
		Baseline, midline and end	The consultant would like to have the following clarity for	The agency needs to cover all the

Section No	Page No	Text	Query	Clarification
		line, which will include the sub-teams in the directorate, district health administration, all the health facilities including 10-DH, - SDH, 7-CHC and 56-PHC, 40 -Sub centre, 100 villages.	<p>sampling:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. What is the sample for each cycle of Evaluation? 2. What would be the SDH sample for objective 1 as it is not mentioned in the ToR? 3. Each evaluation cycle would cover 100 Villages or a sample from 100 villages? 	<p>facilities for Baseline, Midline and End line survey. The number of facilities will be all the DH, SDH, CHC and PHC.</p> <p>The 40 sub centres and 100 villages will be selected from the two districts of Kolasib and Lawngtlai combined. Sample will be selected from these 100 villages in each cycle. The sample size and criteria can be proposed by consultants.</p>
Section 3	70	Reference: 3.7 The Internal performance Agreements in the form of Quality Index will be implemented in 10 DH, 2 SDH, 7 CHC, and 38 PHC.	Internal Performance Agreements in the form of Quality Index are already developed by the client or will it be responsibility of agency? If it is already developed and available can the agency have an access of it to develop the verification tool based on it?	<p>The number of facilities for Internal performance agreement are: DH-9, SDH-2, CHC-9, PHC-39</p> <p>The Internal performance agreement and quality index tools are being developed and will be shared with the contracted agency. These tools will not be ready before the submission deadline.</p>
Section -3	71	The organization will carry out rapid assessments of different project components and/or documentation of good practices based on project needs during the project implementation period.	Rapid assessment frequency will be once in a year or it is different? Please Clarify.	The rapid assessments and documentations will be a minimum of one per year each.
Section 2	33	Experience of completing at least two (2) projects of	The criteria is very restrictive, we request you to please modify the clause as:	Refer to Amendment Sl.no.1

Section No	Page No	Text	Query	Clarification
		similar nature, each having contract value not less than INR 3 Crores executed in last five (5) years.	Experience of at least two (2) completed or ongoing projects of similar nature, each having contract value not less than INR 2.5 Crores executed in last seven (7) years.	
Section 2	33	The number of points to be assigned to each of the above positions (K-1 to K7) shall be determined considering the following three sub-criteria and relevant percentage weights: a. General qualifications (general education, training, and experience): 20% b. Adequacy for the Assignment (relevant education, training, experience in the sector/similar assignments): 50% c. Relevant experience in the region (working level fluency in local language(s)/knowledge of local culture or administrative system, government organization, etc.): 30%	We request you to please modify the clause as: The number of points to be assigned to each of the above positions (K-1to K-7) shall be determined considering the following three sub-criteria and relevant percentage weights: a. General qualifications (general education, training, and experience): 40% b. Adequacy for the Assignment (relevant education, training, experience in the sector/similar assignments): 50% c. Relevant experience in the region (working level fluency in local language(s)/knowledge of local culture or administrative system, government organization, etc.): 10%	Refer to Amendment Sl.no 2.
	97	24.1. The Consultant (i) shall take out and maintain, and	We request you to please modify the clause as:	The clause remains same as in the RFP.

Section No	Page No	Text	Query	Clarification
		<p>shall cause any Sub-consultants to take out and maintain, at its (or the Subconsultants', as the case may be) own cost but on terms and conditions. approved by the Client, insurance against the risks, and for the coverage specified in the SCC, and (ii) at the Client's request, shall provide evidence to the Client showing that such insurance has been taken out and maintained and that the current premiums therefore have been paid. The Consultant shall ensure that such insurance is in place prior to commencing the Services as stated in Clause GCC 13.</p>	<p>24.1. The Consultant (i) shall take out and maintain, and shall cause any Sub- consultants to take out and maintain, at its (or the Sub-consultants', as the case may be), insurance against the risks, and for the coverage specified in the SCC, and (ii) at the Client's request, shall provide evidence to the Client showing that such insurance has been taken out and maintained and that the current premiums therefore have been paid. The Consultant shall ensure that such insurance is in place prior to commencing the Services as stated in Clause GCC 13.</p>	
	111	<p>The insurance coverage against the risks shall be as follows:</p> <p>(a) Professional liability insurance, with a minimum coverage of full value of contract in Rupees;</p> <p>(b) Third Party motor vehicle liability</p>	<p>The insurance coverage against the risks shall be as follows:</p> <p>(a) Professional liability insurance, with a minimum coverage of full value of contract in Rupees; [delete rest of the sections highlighted]</p> <p>(b) Third Party motor vehicle liability insurance in respect of motor vehicles operated in the Client's country by the Consultant or its Experts or Sub-consultants, with a minimum coverage as per the latest Amended Motor Vehicles Act, India;</p>	<p>The clause remains same as in the RFP.</p>

Section No	Page No	Text	Query	Clarification
		<p>insurance in respect of motor vehicles operated in the Client's country by the Consultant or its Experts or Sub-consultants, with a minimum coverage as per the latest Amended Motor Vehicles Act, India;</p> <p>(c) Third Party liability insurance, with a minimum coverage of "in accordance with the applicable law in India";</p> <p>(d) employer's liability and workers' compensation insurance in respect of the experts and Sub-consultants in accordance with the relevant provisions of the applicable law in the Client's country, as well as, with respect to such Experts, any such life, health, accident, travel or other insurance as may be appropriate; and</p>	<p>(c) Third Party liability insurance, with a minimum coverage of "in accordance with the applicable law in India";</p> <p>(d) employer's liability and workers' compensation insurance in respect of the experts and Sub-consultants in accordance with the relevant provisions of the applicable law in the Client's country, as well as, with respect to such Experts, any such life, health, accident, travel or other insurance as may be appropriate; and</p> <p>(e) insurance against loss of or damage to (i) equipment purchased in whole or in part with funds provided under this Contract, (ii) the Consultant's property used in the performance of the Services, and (iii) any documents prepared by the Consultant in the performance of the Services.</p>	

Section No	Page No	Text	Query	Clarification
		<p>(e) insurance against loss of or damage to (i) equipment purchased in whole or in part with funds provided under this Contract, (ii) the Consultant's property used in the performance of the Services, and (iii) any documents prepared by the Consultant in the performance of the Services.</p>		
	96	<p>b. Consultant and Affiliates Not to Engage in Certain Activities 21.1.3 The Consultant agrees that, during the term of this Contract and after its termination, the Consultant and any entity affiliated with the Consultant, as well as any Subconsultants and any entity affiliated with such Sub-consultants, shall be disqualified from providing goods, works or non-consulting services resulting from or directly related to the Consultant's Services for the</p>	<p>We request you to please remove references of "Affiliates"</p>	<p>The clause remains same as in the RFP.</p>

Section No	Page No	Text	Query	Clarification
		preparation or implementation of the project.		
		Date: December 5, 2020 12.00 noon. India Standard Tim	India Standard Time We request you to please give an extension of 15 days in order to submit an informed and quality bid. Date: December 21, 2020 12.00 noon India Standard Time	Refer to Amendment Sl.no 3.
	32	The Consultants "shall not" have the option of submitting their Proposals electronically	Request the authority to allow electronic submission (via e-mail) of the proposal to avoid possible delays in courier/shipping.	The electronic Submission is Mandatory. Refer to Amendment SI.No 4 .
	32	The Consultant must submit: (a) Technical Proposal: one (1) original and (1)copy in hardcopy along with softcopy in CD. (b) Financial Proposal: one (1) original in hardcopy	Request the authority to relax the requirements of submission of softcopy in CD (technical proposal). Request the authority to revise the clause as: The Consultant must submit: (a) Technical Proposal: one (1) original and (1)copy in hardcopy along with softcopy via email. (b) Financial Proposal: one (1) original in Hardcopy	Refer to Amendment sl.no. 4.
	34	Eligibility Conditions states that the agency should have- Experience of completing at least two (2) projects of similar nature, each having contract value not less than INR 3 crores executed in last five (5) years.	As the ToR refers to scope of work on Third Party Verification of Result Based Financing result and Project Evaluation, the consultant understands that similar nature of assignment would mean DLI Verification undertaken in other sectors including health and assignments such as large scale surveys carried out in health sector. Kindly confirm?	DLIs are similar to Results based financing
		The ToR indicates 60	The consultant assumes that this will include home and field days	The definition of home and field

Section No	Page No	Text	Query	Clarification
		months engagement of each of the 7 experts.	input based on the nature of deliverables. Kindly confirm?	based is given in footnotes of - FORM TECH-6 (for FTP and STP)
	70	The surveys will also include patient/s satisfaction survey.	Kindly indicate a sample for patient's survey to have parity in financial estimation by all the bidders.	Sample size can be proposed by the firms/agencies using appropriate statistical method and statistical method can be described with the power and confidence interval.
	71	Towards achieving the objective 4: Concurrent Impact Evaluation cycles	<p>The ToR indicates that the Concurrent Impact Evaluation would be done within first 6 months of 4th year (Deliverable and Payment schedule Table)</p> <p>The consultant assumes that the Impact Evaluation will be done only once towards 4th year. Please confirm if the understanding is correct?</p> <p>Also the deliverable includes pilot initiatives? What would be the sample coverage, total number of pilot initiatives planned under the project?</p>	<p>A total of 10% of the budget for the RFP is estimated to be used for the current impact evaluations of the main project and the pilot initiatives. The summary of the same is given in under the objective 4. "The initially identified areas for impact evaluation may include the impact of clinical vignettes, the impact of quality improvement, the impact of innovations in outreach activity at the sub-centre and village level."</p> <p>The impact evaluations will include pilot initiatives.</p> <p>The firms/agencies can propose their method of impact evaluation which will contribute to the above objective in the give areas.</p>
			The assignment is for 5 years which would mean 20 Quarterly	Verification of results base

Section No	Page No	Text	Query	Clarification
			<p>report. We assume that during the Mid-term and End Term phases two quarterly reports results might be part of the evaluation reports. The total reports to be submitted then would be 18 (18 rounds). Please indicate how it is 16 rounds of field work.</p>	<p>financing is a fixed schedule-routine activity and will not be influenced by the midline or end line survey. A total of 16 rounds will be required for verification, after accounting for baseline, capacity building and project closure activity.</p>

Amendment-1

“Selection of Agency for Third Party Verification of Result Based Financing result and Project Evaluation under Mizoram Health System Strengthening Project (MHSSP)” held on 17 November 2020

Sl.no	Section No	Page No	Text	Now to be read as
1	Section 2	33	Experience of completing at least two (2) projects of similar nature, each having contract value not less than INR 3 Crores executed in last five (5) years.	Experience of completing at least one projects of similar nature, with contract value not less than INR 1 Crores executed in last five (5) years or The ongoing contract which are completed upto 80% as per contract deliverables before the last date of submission of the RFP.
2	Section 2	33	The number of points to be assigned to each of the above positions (K-1 to K7) shall be determined considering the following three sub-criteria and relevant percentage weights: a. General qualifications (general education, training, and experience): 20% b. Adequacy for the Assignment (relevant education, training, experience in the sector/similar assignments): 50% c. Relevant experience in the region (working level fluency in local language(s)/knowledge of local culture or administrative system, government organization, etc.): 30%	Amendment: The number of points to be assigned to each of the above positions (K-1 to K-7) shall be determined considering the following three sub-criteria and relevant percentage weights: a. General qualifications (general education, training, and experience): 30% b. Adequacy for the Assignment (relevant education, training, experience in the sector/similar assignments): 60% c. Relevant experience in the North east region of India i.e. states of Arunachal Pradesh, Assam, Manipur, Meghalaya, Mizoram, Tripura, Nagaland and Sikkim. (working level fluency in local language(s)/knowledge of local culture or administrative system, government organization, etc.): 10%
3	ITB datasheet 17.7 and 17.9 Date: Date: December 5, 2020 12.00 noon. India Standard Time			The Proposals must be submitted online through email no later than: Date: December 14, 2020 12.00 noon Indian Standard Time. Proposals should be submitted through email as per the procedure stated at Annexure II.

<p>4</p>	<p>ITB datasheet 19.1 The opening shall take place at: Conference Hall, <u>Directorate of Health Services, Health & Family Welfare Department, Dintar, Aizawl, Mizoram, Pin 796009</u></p> <p>Date: December 5, 2020.</p> <p>Time: 15.30 hrs to 16.30 hrs . India Standard Time</p>			<p>Online submission through email is mandatory.</p> <p>Technical proposals shall be opened on 14th December 2020, at 1 pm Indian Standard Time. <i>Consultants who have submitted proposals can view the Proposal Opening through video conference. The link shall be provided to those who have submitted the proposals through email by 12.30 PM on the date of opening.</i></p>
<p>5</p>	<p>ITB datasheet 17.4 Proposal submission</p>	<p>32</p>	<p>The Consultant must submit: (a) Technical Proposal: one (1) original and (1) copy in hardcopy along with softcopy in CD. (b) Financial Proposal: one (1) original in hardcopy</p>	<p>The consultant shall submit the proposals electronically through email as detailed at Annexure II. Proposals submitted through email shall only be considered. In addition to the email submission, consultants shall also submit the hard-true copies as per the procedure detailed in the RFP. The hard-true copies of proposals should reach within last date of email submission plus 10 days. The hard-true copies of proposals without email submission within due date shall not be considered.</p> <p>In case of any discrepancy between the hard copy and email submission, the email submission will be considered as the final.</p>

<p>6</p>	<p>RFP Reference number: IN- DOHFW- 201459-CS- QCBS General Condition of Contract 23.1</p>	<p>Page 111</p>	<p>“Limitation of the Consultant’s Liability towards the Client:</p> <p>(a) Except in the case of gross negligence or willful misconduct on the part of the Consultant or on the part of any person or a firm acting on behalf of the Consultant in carrying out the Services, the Consultant, with respect to damage caused by the Consultant to the Client’s property, shall not be liable to the Client:</p> <p>(i) for any indirect or consequential loss or damage; and</p> <p>(ii) for any direct loss or damage that exceeds [insert a multiplier, e.g.: one, two, three] times the total value of the Contract;</p> <p>(b) This limitation of liability shall not</p> <p>(i) affect the Consultant’s liability, if any, for damage to Third Parties caused by the Consultant or any person or firm acting on behalf of the Consultant in carrying out the Services.</p> <p>(ii) be construed as providing the Consultant with any limitation or exclusion from liability which is prohibited by the Applicable Law in India”.</p>	<p>“Limitation of the Consultant’s Liability towards the Client:</p> <p>(a) Except in the case of gross negligence or willful misconduct on the part of the Consultant or on the part of any person or a firm acting on behalf of the Consultant in carrying out the Services, the Consultant, with respect to damage caused by the Consultant to the Client’s property, shall not be liable to the Client:</p> <p>(i) for any indirect or consequential loss or damage; and</p> <p>(ii) for any direct loss or damage that exceeds the total value of the Contract</p> <p>Rest of the clause under this section remains as it is.</p>
----------	--	-----------------	---	--

Annexure II

Electronic Submission of Proposals:

In view of COVID19 prevailing situation, proposals shall be accepted through email. Proposals should be submitted mandatorily through email. The procedure for sending and accepting proposals are detailed below:

Steps 1: Submission of Proposal

1. The proposal should be sent by email at wb.mhssp@gmail.com
2. The subject of email should mention the following:
Proposal No. IN-DOHFW-201459-CS-QCBS. Titled "Selection of Agency for Third Party Verification of Result Based Financing result and Project Evaluation under Mizoram Health Systems Strengthening Project (MHSSP) "
3. The email should be addressed to the
Project Director,
Mizoram Health Systems Strengthening Project,
Aizawl, Mizoram

RFP No. IN-DOHFW-201459-CS-QCBS

RFP Title "Selection of Agency for Third Party Verification of Result Based Financing result and Project Evaluation under Mizoram Health Systems Strengthening Project (MHSSP) "

Attention: Proposals not to be opened before 14/12/2020 at 13.00 hrs

Sender's name

Designation

Organisation name

Mobile Number

Alternate Mobile Number

4. The email should contain the Technical Proposal and Financial Proposal in the prescribed forms as given in the RFP as email attachment in soft copy and password protected. Both Technical Proposal and Financial Proposal should be separate PDF attachments in one email.
5. Please make sure to submit technical proposal & financial proposal as 2 separate attachments in one email. Please ensure Technical and financial proposal should not be in a single attachment.
6. The consultant should send only one email containing proposal for RFP.
7. The proposal should be prepared with A4 size paper and font size of 12 in PDF only.
8. Financial figures of the Financial Proposal should not be given in Technical Proposal or in any part of the email except in the Financial Proposal.
9. Passwords of electronic files of Technical Proposal and Financial Proposal should be different from each other. Passwords should not be mentioned anywhere in these two documents as well as in this email.
10. The Technical Proposal submission form (Form TECH-1) and complete Financial Proposal should be signed and scanned by the authorized representative.
11. The Technical Proposal should be scanned in the order of forms as prescribed in the RFP. The file should be scanned as one PDF, password protected, and size should not be more than 15MB. The password of the Technical proposal should not be shared with anyone.
12. The electronic file of the Technical Proposal should be named as "TechP"+Bidder name in initials+RFP Number. The file type should be PDF only.

13. The Financial Proposal should be scanned separately from the Technical Proposal. This file should be password protected. The file size should not be more than 10MB. The password of this file should be different from the password assigned to the file containing Technical Proposal.
14. The electronic file of the Financial Proposal should be named as “FinP”+Bidder name in initials+RFP Number. The file type should be PDF only.
15. Files should not be corrupt. They should be virus free. They should be password protected. If the Project is not able to open your file, then your Proposal will be rejected.
16. The proposal should reach the designated email of the Project by the date and time specified in the RFP (including corrigendum, if any).

Step 2: Submission of password for Technical Proposal

1. Password of the file containing Technical Proposal should be shared on the email (wb.mhssp@gmail.com)as specified in RFP only. Password should not be shared in any other form and with any officer from the Project.
2. The password of the file containing Technical Proposal should be shared only between 12 Noon to 1 PM on the date of opening of the technical proposal. Password should not be shared before one hour of the designated date and time of opening of the Proposal.
3. The subject of email should mention the following:
Password for Technical Proposal for Proposal No. IN-DOHFW-201459-CS-QCBS. Titled “Selection of Agency for Third Party Verification of Result Based Financing result and Project Evaluation under Mizoram Health Systems Strengthening Project (MHSSP)”. The email should be addressed to the

Project Director,
Mizoram Health Systems Strengthening Project,
Aizawl, Mizoram

RFP No. IN-DOHFW-201459-CS-QCBS
RFP Title “Selection of Agency for Third Party Verification of Result Based Financing result and Project Evaluation under Mizoram Health Systems Strengthening Project (MHSSP) “

Password to open the file containing Technical Proposal is - xxxxxxx

Sender’s name

Designation

Organisation name

Mobile Number

Alternate Mobile Number

4. Please ensure that you write the correct password in the email. The password should be to open Technical Proposal only.
5. The password to open the file containing Technical Proposal should be sent only from the email which was used to submit the Proposal. Password from any other email will not be accepted.

Step 3: Opening of the Technical Proposal

Technical proposals shall be opened on 14th December 2020, at 1 pm Indian Standard Time. Consultants who have submitted the proposal can view the opening through video conference. The link shall be provided to those who have submitted the proposals through email by 12.30 PM on the date of opening.

Step 5: Opening of Financial Proposal

1. Date and time of opening of Financial Proposals shall be informed to technically qualified bidders through email on the email address on which proposals were received.
2. Technically qualified bidders will be asked to send the password of the file containing Financial Proposal.
3. Password of the file containing Financial Proposal should be shared on the email wb.mhssp@gmail.com . Password should not be shared in any other form and with any officer from the Project.
4. The password of the file containing Financial Proposal should be shared only within one hour of the of the designated date and time of opening of the Financial Proposal. Password should not be shared before one hour of the designated date and time of opening of the Financial Proposal.
5. The subject of email should mention the following:
Password for Financial Proposal for Proposal No. IN-DOHFW-201459-CS-QCBS.
Titled “Selection of Agency for Third Party Verification of Result Based Financing result and Project Evaluation under Mizoram Health Systems Strengthening Project (MHSSP)”.
6. The email should be addressed to the
Project Director,
Mizoram Health Systems Strengthening Project,
Aizwal

RFP No. IN-DOHFW-201459-CS-QCBS

RFP Title “Selection of Agency for Third Party Verification of Result Based Financing result and Project Evaluation under Mizoram Health Systems Strengthening Project (MHSSP) “

Password to open the file containing Financial Proposal is - zzzzzzzzz

Sender’s name

Designation

Organisation name

Mobile Number

Alternate Mobile

7. Please ensure that you write the correct password in the email. The password should be to open Financial Proposal only.
8. If an incorrect password is provided or the file gets corrupted, then the proposal will be rejected.
9. The password to open the file containing Financial Proposal should be sent only from the email which was used to submit the Proposal. Password from any other email will not be accepted.